



Inside, Outside: Where Does Torah Belong?

R. Tali Adler – adler@hadar.org

Spring Lecture Series 2023

1. Moed Katan 16a	3. מועד קטן טז.
<p>Once again, on another occasion, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi decreed that students not be taught in the marketplace but only in a study hall. What verse did he expound to serve as the basis for this decree? The verse states: “Your rounded thighs are like jewels, the work of the hands of an artist” (Song of Songs 7:2). Just as a thigh is ordinarily hidden and kept covered with clothes, so too, the words of Torah, which are “the work of the hands of an artist,” must remain hidden in the study hall.</p> <p>Despite Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi’s decree, Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> went out and taught his two nephews, Rav and Rabba bar bar Hana, in the marketplace. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi heard what he had done and became angry with him. When Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> came at some later date to visit him, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi mockingly said to him: Iyya, who is calling you outside? By asking this question Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi was intimating that Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> should leave his house. Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> understood that Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi had taken the matter to heart and was insulted, and so he conducted himself as if he had been admonished, as a self-imposed punishment, for thirty days.</p> <p>...§ Concerning the issue with which the entire incident had begun, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi asked Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u>: What is the reason that you, the Master, acted as you did, ignoring my instructions not to teach</p>	<p>שוב פעם אחד גזר רבי שלא ישנו לתלמידים בשוק, מאי דרש — “חמוקי ירכיה כמו חלאים”. מה ירח בסתר, אף דברי תורה בסתר יצא רבי חייא וישנה לשני בני אחיו בשוק לרב ולרבה בר (בר) חנה שמע רבי איכפד אתא רבי חייא לאיתחזוי ליה אמר ליה עיאי מי קורא לך בחוץ ידע דנקט מילתא בדעתיה נהג נזיפותא בנפשיה תלתין יומין ביום תלתין שלח ליה תא הדר שלח ליה דלא ליתי מעיקרא מאי</p>

Torah in the marketplace? Rabbi Hiyya said to him: As it is written: “Wisdom cries aloud in the streets” (Proverbs 1:20), which implies that Torah should be publicized in the streets. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to him: If you read this verse once, you certainly did not read it a second time in greater depth; and if you read it a second time, you certainly did not read it a third time; and if you read it a third time, then it was not adequately explained to you, as it is clear that you do not understand it properly.

The words: “Wisdom cries aloud in the streets,” should be understood in accordance with the opinion of Rava. As Rava said: With regard to everyone who occupies himself with Torah study inside the privacy of his home, his Torah knowledge will proclaim his greatness outside, as it will be revealed to the masses and they will see his greatness.

The Gemara asks: But isn’t it written: “From the beginning I have not spoken in secret” (Isaiah 48:16), implying that the Torah should be taught and proclaimed in public? The Gemara answers: That verse is referring to the days of the *kalla*, the gathering for Torah study held during Elul and Adar, when many people come to listen to Torah discourses. During this time, it is not only permitted but even recommended to teach Torah to the masses. In this way, the verse can be explained in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi.

The Gemara asks: And what did Rabbi Hiyya do with this verse: “Your rounded thighs are like jewels”? How did he understand it? This verse implies that the Torah must be kept hidden in the study hall and not publicized in the marketplace. The Gemara explains: He interprets it not as a reference to Torah, but as referring to acts of charity and loving-kindness, which should certainly be performed in private.

סָבַר וּלְבִסּוֹף מָאִי
 סָבַר מַעֲיָקְרָא סָבַר
 מְקַצֵּת הַיּוֹם כְּכוֹלּוֹ
 וּלְבִסּוֹף סָבַר לֹא
 אֶמְרִינָן מְקַצֵּת הַיּוֹם
 כְּכוֹלּוֹ לְסוֹף אֶתָּא
 אָמַר לִיה אֲמַאי
 אֶתִּית אָמַר לִיה
 דְּשַׁלַּח לִי מֶרְדְּלִיתִי
 וְהָא שְׁלַחִי לָךְ דְּלֵא
 תִּיתִי אָמַר לִיה זֶה
 רְאִיתִי זֶה לֹא רְאִיתִי
 קָרִי עָלֶיהָ בְּרֻצוֹת הִ'
 דְּרַכִּי אִישׁ גַּם אוֹיְבִיו
 יִשְׁלִים אֹתוֹ מָאִי
 טַעְמָא עֲבַד מֶרְ הָכִי
 אָמַר לִיה דְּכָתִיב
 חֻקֹּמוֹת בַּחוּץ תִּרְוֹנָה
 אָמַר לִיה אִם קָרִית
 לֹא שְׁנִית וְאִם שְׁנִית
 לֹא שִׁלְשֶׁת וְאִם
 שִׁלְשֶׁת לֹא פִּירְשׁוּ
 לָךְ חֻקֹּמוֹת בַּחוּץ
 תִּרְוֹנָה כְּדֶרֶבָּא
 דְּאָמַר רַבָּא כֹּל
 הָעוֹסֵק בִּתְוֹרָה
 מִבְּפָנִים תּוֹרָתוֹ
 מְכַרְזֵת עָלָיו מִבַּחוּץ
 וְהָא כְּתִיב לֹא מֵרֹאשׁ
 בִּסְתֵּר דִּבְרֵתֵי הָהוּא
 בְּיוֹמֵי דְכָלָה וְרַבִּי
 חֲזִיא הָאִי חֲמוּקִי
 יִרְכִּיךָ מָאִי עֲבִיד לָהּ



	מוקי לה בצדקה ובגמילות חסדים
--	---------------------------------

2. Bava Batra 8a	2. בבא בתרא ח'.
<p>It is related that Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi once opened his storehouses to distribute food during years of drought. He said: Masters of Bible, masters of Mishnah, masters of Talmud, masters of <i>halakha</i>, masters of <i>aggada</i> may enter and receive food from me, but ignoramuses should not enter. Rabbi Yonatan ben Amram, whom Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi did not know, pushed his way in, and entered, and said to him: Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi, sustain me. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to him: My son, have you read the Bible? Rabbi Yonatan ben Amram said to him, out of modesty: No. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi continued: Have you studied Mishnah? Once again, Rabbi Yonatan ben Amram said to him: No. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi then asked him: If so, by what merit should I sustain you? Rabbi Yonatan ben Amram said to him: Sustain me like a dog and like a raven, who are given food even though they have not learned anything. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi was moved by his words and fed him.</p> <p>After Rabbi Yonatan left, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi sat, and was distressed, and said: Woe is me, that I have given my bread to an ignoramus. His son, Rabbi Shimon bar Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi, said to him: Perhaps he was your disciple Yonatan ben Amram, who never in his life wanted to materially benefit from the honor shown to the Torah? They investigated the matter and found that such was the case. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi then said: Let</p>	<p> רבי פתח אוצרות בשני בצורת אמר יכנסו בעלי מקרא בעלי משנה בעלי תלמוד בעלי הלכה בעלי הגדה אבל עמי הארץ אל יכנסו דחק רבי יונתן בן עמרם ונכנס אמר לו רבי פרנסני אמר לו בני קרית אמר לו לאו שנית אמר לו לאו אם כן במה אפרנסך [אמר לו] פרנסני ככלב וכעורב פרנסיה </p> <p> בתר דנפק יתיב רבי וקא מצטער ואמר אוי לי שנתתי פתי לעם הארץ אמר לפניו רבי שמעון בר רבי שמא יונתן בן עמרם תלמידך הוא שאינו רוצה ליהנות מכבוד תורה מימיו בדקו ואשכח אמר רבי יכנסו הכל רבי לטעמיה דאמר רבי אין פורענות בא לעולם אלא בשביל עמי הארץ כההוא דמי כליא דשדו אטבריא </p>



<p>everyone enter, as there may also be others who hide the fact that they are true Torah scholars.</p> <p>Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi says: Suffering comes to the world only due to ignoramuses. This is like the incident of the crown tax [<i>kelila</i>] that was imposed on the residents of the city of Tiberias. The heads of the city came before Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi and said to him: The Sages should contribute along with us. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to them: No, the Sages are exempt. They said to him: Then we will run away and the entire burden will fall on the Torah scholars. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to them: Run away as you please. Half of the city's residents ran away. The authorities then waived half the sum that they had initially imposed on the city.</p> <p>The half of the population that remained in the city then came before Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi, and said to him: The Sages should contribute along with us. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to them: No, the Sages are exempt. They said to him: Then we too will run away. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to them: Run away as you please. They all ran away, so that only one launderer was left in the city. The authorities imposed the entire tax on the launderer. The launderer then ran away as well. The crown tax was then canceled in its entirety. Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said: You see from this that suffering comes to the world only due to ignoramuses, for as soon as they all fled from the city, the crown tax was completely canceled.</p>	<p>אָתוּ לְקִמְיָה דְּרַבִּי וְאָמְרוּ לִיָּה לִיתְבוּ רַבְּנָן בְּהֵדֵן אָמַר לְהוּ לֹא אָמְרוּ לִיָּה עֲרוּקִין [אָמַר לְהוּ] עֲרוּקוּ עֲרוּקוּ פְּלִגְיָהוֹן דְּלִיָּוִה פְּלִגָּא</p> <p>אָתוּ הִנְהוּ פְּלִגָּא קִמְיָ דְּרַבִּי אָמְרוּ לִיָּה לִיתְבוּ רַבְּנָן בְּהֵדֵן אָמַר לְהוּ לֹא עֲרוּקִין עֲרוּקוּ עֲרוּקוּ כּוּלְהוּ פִּשְׁ הָהוּא כּוּבֵס שְׁדִיָּוִה אַכּוּבֵס עֲרוּק כּוּבֵס פִּקְעָה קְלִילָא אָמַר רַבִּי רְאִיתֶם שְׂאִין פּוֹרְעָנוֹת בָּא לְעוֹלָם אֶלָּא בְּשִׁבִּיל עֲמִי הָאָרֶץ:</p>
--	---

3. Ketubot 103b	3. כתובות קג:
-----------------	---------------



<p>Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> said to Rabbi <u>Hanina</u>: I am working to ensure that the Torah will not be forgotten from the Jewish people. For I bring flax and I plant it, and I then weave nets from the flax fibers. I then go out and trap deer, and I feed the meat to orphans, and I form scrolls from the skins of the deer. And I go to a town that has no teachers of children in it and I write the five books of the Torah for five children. And I teach the six orders of the Mishnah to six children. To each and every one of these children I say: Teach your order to your friends. In this way all of the children will learn the whole of the Torah and the Mishnah.</p> <p>And this is what Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi referred to when he said: How great are the actions of <u>Hiyya</u>. Rabbi Shimon, son of Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi, said to his father: Even greater than your works? He said to him: Yes.</p>	<p>א"ל ר' חייא אנא עבדי דלא משתכחה תורה מישראל דאיייתנא כיתנא ושדיינא ומגדלנא נישבי וציידנא טביא ומאכילנא בישרא ליתמי ואריכנא מגילתא ממשכי דטביא וסליקנא למתא דלית בה מקרי דרדקי וכתבינא חמשא חומשי לחמשא ינוקי ומתנינא שיתא סידרי לשיתא ינוקי לכל חד וחד אמרי ליה אתני סידרך לחברך</p>
---	---

4. Nedarim 41a	4. נדרים מא.
<p>The Gemara relates: When Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi would learn thirteen aspects of a <i>halakha</i> on a certain issue, he taught Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> seven of them. Ultimately, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi fell ill and forgot all thirteen aspects. Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> restored those seven aspects that Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi taught him by</p>	<p>כי הוה גמיר רבי תלת עשרי אפי' הילכתא אגמריה לרבי חייא שבעה מנהון לסוף חלש רבי אהדר רבי חייא קמיה הנהו שבעה אפי' דאגמריה</p>



<p>reviewing them before Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi. However, six were gone and forgotten, as Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi had not taught them to anyone. There was a certain launderer who would hear Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi when he was studying those <i>halakhot</i>. Rabbi <u>Hiyya</u> went and learned those <i>halakhot</i> from the launderer and he came and restored them by reviewing them before Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi. When Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi saw that launderer, Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi said to him: You made me and <u>Hiyya</u>, as we were able to learn these <i>halakhot</i> that otherwise would have been forgotten. Some say that this is what he said to the launderer: You made <u>Hiyya</u>, and <u>Hiyya</u> made me.</p>	<p>שִׁיתָא אֲזִידוּ הָוָה הָוָה קִצְרָא הָוָה שְׁמִיעַ לִיהָ לְרַבִּי כְּדֵהוּ גָּרִיס לְהוּ אֲזַל רַבִּי חִיָּיא וְגַמְר יְתֵהוֹן קָמִי קִצְרָא וְאַתָּא וְאַהֲדָר יְתֵהוֹן קָמִי רַבִּי כְּדֵהוּ חֲזִי לִיהָ רַבִּי לְהָוָה קִצְרָא אֲמַר לִיהָ רַבִּי אַתָּה עָשִׂיתָ אוֹתִי וְאַתָּה חִיָּיא אֵיכָא דְאָמַרִי הֲכִי קִאֲמַר לִיהָ אַתָּה עָשִׂיתָ אֶת חִיָּיא וְחִיָּיא עָשָׂה אוֹתִי</p>
--	--

<p>5. Ketubot 103a–103b</p>	<p>5. כתובות ק"ג. –ק"ג:</p>
<p>Our Rabbis taught: When Rebbe was about to depart from this life he said, 'I require the presence of my sons'. When his sons entered into his presence he instructed them: 'Take care that you show due respect to your mother. The light shall continue to burn in its usual place, the table shall be laid in its usual place and my bed shall be spread in its usual place. Joseph of Haifa and Simeon of Efrath who attended on me in my lifetime shall attend on me when I am dead'....</p> <p>'I require'. he said to them, 'the presence of the Sages of Israel', and the Sages of Israel entered into his presence. 'Do not lament for me', he said to them, 'in the smaller towns, and reassemble the college after thirty days. My son Simeon</p>	<p>ת"ר בשעת פטירתו של רבי אמר לבני אני צריך נכנסו בניו אצלו אמר להם הזהרו בכבוד אמכם נר יהא דלוק במקומו שולחן יהא ערוך במקומו מטה תהא מוצעת במקומה יוסף חפני שמעון אפרתי הם שמשוני בחיי והם ישמשוני במותי....</p> <p>דרבי הוא דאהניא להו אמר להן לחכמי ישראל אני צריך נכנסו אצלו חכמי ישראל אמר להן אל תספדוני בעיירות והושיבו</p>



is wise my son Gamaliel Nasi and Hanina b. Hama shall preside at the college.'

'Do not lament for me in the smaller towns'. He was understood to give this instruction In order to cause less trouble for the people. As it was observed, however, that when lamentations were held in the large towns everybody came they arrived at the conclusion that his instruction was in order to enhance the honor of the people, so that they may be honored in greater measure through him.

'Reassemble the college after thirty days', because he thought 'I am not more important than our teacher Moses concerning whom it is Written in Scripture, *And the children of Israel wept for Moses in the plains of Moab thirty days*'. For thirty days they mourned both day and night; subsequently they mourned in the day-time and studied at night or mourned at night and studied during the day, until a period of twelve months of mourning passed

The Gemara relates that on the day of the funeral of Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi, a Divine Voice emerged and said: Whoever was present at the funeral of Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi is destined for life in the World-to-Come. There was a certain launderer who would come before Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi every day. On that particular day, he did not come and was therefore not present at the funeral. When he heard this, that Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi had died, he was so full of grief that he ascended to the roof and fell to the ground and died. A Divine Voice emerged and said: That launderer too is destined for life in the World-to-Come.

ישיבה לאחר שלשים יום שמעון
בני חכם גמליאל בני נשיא חנינא
בר חמא ישב בראש: אל
תספדוני בעיירות: סבור מינה
משום טרחא הוא דקאמר כיון
דחזי דקספדי בכרכים וקאתו
כולי עלמא אמרו שמע מינה
משום יקרא הוא דקאמר הושיבו
ישיבה לאחר שלשים יום דלא
עדיפנא ממשה רבינו דכתיב
(דברים לד, ח) ויבכו בני ישראל
את משה בערבות מואב שלשים
יום תלתין יומין ספדין ביממא
וליליא מכאן ואילך ספדו ביממא
וגרסי בליליא או ספדו בליליא
וגרסי ביממא עד דספדי תריסר
ירחי

ההוא יומא דאשכבתייה דרבי
נפקא בת קלא ואמרה כל דהוה
באשכבתייה דרבי מזומן הוא
לחיי העוה"ב ההוא כובס כל
יומא הוה אתי קמיה ההוא יומא
לא אתא כיון דשמע הכי סליק
לאיגרא ונפל לארעא ומית יצתה
בת קול ואמרה אף ההוא כובס
מזומן הוא לחיי העולם הבא:

